

The Presbytery of Westminster met in Regular Session on Tuesday, April 7, 2020 at 7:00pm via Zoom Video Conferencing due to the CoVid-19 restrictions on in-person meetings. Worship was led by Rev. Dr. Jim Smith.

## CONSTITUTION

The Moderator, Cal MacLeod constituted the Court and opened the meeting with prayer at 7:35 pm.

The Moderator welcomed the following guests:

Garland Chow, George Sze, Victor Ling and Adrian Wong; all elders of Vancouver Chinese Presbyterian Church.

## DOCKET

It was moved by Victor Kim, seconded by David Jennings that the consent agenda below be adopted.

**CARRIED**

### Consent Agenda:

- that the Docket be as indicated,
- that the attendance be recorded as noted in the Roll Record Book,
- that regrets and requests for permission to withdraw be noted as sent to the clerk of presbytery,
- that the minutes of the regular meeting held on March 3, 2020 be adopted,
- that the correspondence be dealt with as indicated,
- that reports without recommendations be received "for information."
- that reports with recommendations be received and their recommendations considered,
- that the presbytery treasurer be permitted to speak to financial issues.

If the Court is agreed, these motions will be adopted at the beginning of the meeting. Any member may ask for an issue on the consent agenda to be withdrawn from this list before the agenda is adopted.

## ROLL

### Constituent Roll:

M. Baxter, H. Botha, B. Childs, L. Deacon, P. Dutcher-Walls, P. Eastwood, M. Fontaine, B. Fraser, S. Goble, D. Howard, T. Hsieh, G. Jay, V. Kim, R. Lockhart, C. MacLeod, R. Simpson, B. Skelding, J. Smith, G. Snyman, R. Topping, W. van de Wall, W. van der Westhuizen, M. Wong.

N. Abramson, A. Bauman, A. Beattie, J. Con, B. Feick, L. Gorman, R. Harry, D. Jennings, K. Kim, A. Lin, R. Miller, K. Patrick, K. Sewell, B. Shepansky, G. Shields, S. Stacey, E. Wilson, L. Yen, M. Zaine.

Appendix:

A. Aicken, L. Bae, G. Davis, B. Garvin, R. Robin, R. Watson.

Students:

S. Stephen,  
 A. Perrett

**REGRETS**

I. Evans, K. Jordan

Permission to withdraw given to: none

**CORRESPONDENCE:** 02-24-20 through to 04-01-20

02-22-20	Ron Miller	Trust Deed for Knox PC requiring Clerk's signature	Received and responded
02-24-20	Terrie-Lee Hamilton	GA Nominations for Standing Committees due February 28 <sup>th</sup>	Received
After administrative committee meeting but before March 3 Presbytery Meeting			
02-25-20	Larry Eastwood	WE230 St John's PC Statistical Reports	Received
02-25-20	Richard Watson	Around the Well Report to Presbytery	Received
02-25-20	Gordon PC	Cal MacLeod requests study leave April 29-May 9 for a Renewing Worship Course	Received forwarded to Ministry Committee
02-25-20	Susan Stacey	Request from Kerrisdale PC on next steps with issues surrounding the Call process	Responded
02-26-20	Brian Fraser	Letter of resignation as IM for Kerrisdale PC	Received and forwarded to Ministry Committee
02-26-20	Janet Holman	Statistical Report for Calvin submitted	Received and forwarded to the PCC
02-26-20	Pam Wong	Statistical Reports for Brentwood submitted	Received and forwarded to the PCC
02-27-20	Lydia Bae	Enquiring about transferring her membership from the Presbytery of Brampton to POW	Received and corresponded with the Clerk of Brampton
02-28-20	Cameron Hart	Statistical Forms for St. Columba	Received and forward to the PCC

02-28-20	Laurie Deacon	Financial Status for First Church needing review	Received and forwarded to Ministry Committee
02-29-20	George Robertson	Statistical Report submitted from Gordon PC	Received and forwarded to the PCC
02-29-20	Woldy Sosnowsky	Formal resignation letter as IM of Kerrisdale PC effective 01-01-20	Received and forwarded to Ministry
03-02-20	Arthur Lin	Trust Deed draft for BTPC for review	Received and responded
03-02-20	Larry Eastwood	POW Financial Reports for Presbytery	Received
03-02-20	Brian Fraser	Application for Regional Resourcing Grant for Christian Urban Camps	Received
03-02-20	Richard Watson	Around the Well February Report to POW with recommendations	Received and circulated
03-03-20	Liz Brewer	Looking for English/Korean Translator within the Vancouver area for the Committee on Education and Reception	Received and responded
03-03-20	Susan Stacey	Report from Kerrisdale Session on the suspended call at Kerrisdale	Received
03-04-20	Jonah Lin	Letter of thanks for updating his membership status to the Appendix as minister without charge. Also, requesting letter from POW acknowledging that he is still a minister of Word and Sacraments in good standing with the PCC	Received and responded
03-04-20	Kathryn Muir	February 2020 Changes to the Roll	Received
03-04-20	Michael Pettem/Presbytery of Montreal	Re: Dale Wood's Call documents, seeking supporting documents for consideration by Presb. of Montreal	Received and replied
03-05-20	Brian Dennehy	Camp Douglas Work Party scheduled for April 4 <sup>th</sup>	Received and circulated
03-07-20	Maxine Pigott	St Andrew's-Newton 2019 Statistical and financial Report electronic version	Received
03-10-20	Daniel Martinez	Congregations looking for CD staff to visit and on Camp Douglas Sunday to contact Ryan Siverns at <a href="mailto:ryan@siverns.com">ryan@siverns.com</a> or (604) 765-6534	Circulated
03-12-30	Linda MacLeod	Central PC Session is requesting a meeting with representatives from the POW to discuss the difficulties around the finances	Noted and referred to Strategy and Leadership
03-12-20	Brian Fraser	Final IM report for Kerrisdale	Received

03-13-20	Linda MacLeod	Session of Central PC requesting that Brian Fraser be appointed as IM on the retirement of Jim Smith	Noted and forwarded to Ministry
03-14-20	PCC	Response to COVID-19 and Worship	Received and distributed`
03-14-20	Cal MacLeod	Orientation and Polity Meeting for March 21 postponed	Distributed
03-16-20	Don Muir	Clerk's consultation for April cancelled due to COVID-19	Noted
03-16-20	Paddy Eastwood	Jerry Low is no longer Rep Elder for Coquitlam PC	Noted
03-16-20	Linda MacLeod	Requesting meeting with members of Presbytery whom are not on the S&L Committee	Responded that S&L is the appropriate committee for this meeting
03-16-20	Don Muir	Rescheduled date for Clerk's Consultation is set for April 16-19, 2021	Noted
03-16-20	Arthur Lin	Statistical reports for Burnaby Taiwanese PC	Received
03-17-20	Maggie Leung	WE Presbytery Sharing Reports for January 2020	Noted
03-18-20	Marjorie Copeland	Letter acknowledging POW has a YAR candidate for GA 2020	Received
03-18-20	Marjorie Copeland	Letter acknowledging POW submitted 40 ballots for Moderator GA 2020	Received
03-19-20	Ross Lockhart	Centre for Missional Leadership Monday online gathering for pastoral leaders to be held via ZOOM	Received and distributed
03-20-20	Glen Davis	Requesting information on grants: names of grants, types of grants, deadlines for grants	Noted and responded
03-20-20	Miklos Szgeti	Question of procedure for finances during this pandemic	Noted and responded
03-21-20	Marianne Lazaro	Session of Langley agreed to increase in ministry time for Rev. Howard	Noted and forms filled out and sent to PCC
03-22-20	Ted Siverns	Article: Journal of Theology and The Church is available for distribution. Interested parties to contact Ted directly.	Distributed
03-23-20	Terrie-Lee Hamilton	GA 2020 has been cancelled. All business to be forwarded to the Executive of the Assembly Council.	Noted and distributed

03-24-20	Jen de Combe	Applications for Grants continues during pandemic. Deadline is April 15 <sup>th</sup>	Noted and circulated
03-25-20	Daniel Martinez	Camp Douglas Work Party cancelled	Distributed
03-26-20	Marjorie Copeland/Terrie-Lee Hamilton	Clerks to submit Presbytery reports for a new form of A&P	Noted
03-26-20	Cameron Hart	New Ministry Contract for Calvin Crichton for 2020/2021	Received and forwarded to Ministry
03-27-20	Don Muir	Questions and challenges around: Payroll, online meetings and digital donations	Received and circulated
03-27-20	Isabel Evans	Hummingbird is looking for someone with experience working with children aged 6-14yrs around the topic of bullying	Distributed
03-28-20	Lori Hastings	Langley PC Statistical Forms	Received and forwarded to PCC
03-28-20	Ruth Chueh	Session of VTPC has agreed as per the request of Ta Li Hsieh to postpone his study leave	Noted and forwarded to Ministry Committee
03-28-20	Ruth Chueh	Petition to ask Canada Post to commemorate Rev. George L MacKay on a Canadian Stamp	Noted
03-30-20	Liane Maki	Receipt of Dennis Howard's Updated Pension Form	Noted
03-31-20	John Paeng, Clerk of Vancouver Island	Call to Stephen Bell from Knox Presbyterian Church, Sooke, BC.	Received and will be considered at the April 7 meeting of presbytery
03-31-20	Glen Davis	Notice of process around Calling a minister when in person meetings are not possible	Noted for reference
03-31-20	David Jennings	Notice around deadlines for PIM grants and also provision for timing in light of meetings of presbytery during the COVID-19 crisis	Received and circulated
04-01-20	Don Muir	Calling a Minister when in person meetings are not possible	Received and circulated

## REPORTS

### ADMINISTRATIVE COMMITTEE REPORT

*The report was presented Victor Kim, Administrative Committee Convener.*

*All motions, unless otherwise noted, were moved by Victor Kim, seconded by Paddy Eastwood.*

#### **Administrative Committee Report – April 7, 2020**

- Motions regarding the call from Knox Presbyterian Church, Sooke, B.C. to Stephen Bell.

**Recommendation 1:** That the call from Knox Presbyterian Church, Sooke, to Stephen Bell be considered. **CARRIED**

**Recommendation 2:** That the Rev. Dr. Ross Lockhart speak on behalf of the Presbytery of Vancouver Island. **CARRIED**

**Recommendation 3:** That the call be sustained as a true gospel call. **CARRIED**

Since Stephen Bell is a graduating student, the call procedure will be suspended with the presbytery's sustaining of the call. The call is not placed in Mr. Bell's hands at this point, but instead Mr. Bell will be asked to indicate whether he is willing for the call to proceed. He will have seven days to give his decision. The implication of this decision is that the student will not seek other calls at this point nor consent to his name being placed in any other call.

Should the presbytery sustain the call and once Mr. Bell has formally met the requirements for graduation from VST/SAH, which should be May 25, 2020, the presbytery will place the call in his hands and Mr. Bell will have seven days to decide whether to accept or decline the call.

**Mr. Bell confirmed that he is willing for the call to proceed.**

**Recommendation 4:** That the Moderator and Clerk be given power to issue to place the call in Stephen Bell's hands upon his meeting the requirements for graduation from VST/SAH, and that Mr. Bell would have the normal number of days, seven, to either accept or decline the call. **CARRIED**

**Recommendation 5:** Upon completion of the requirements for graduation and the acceptance of the call arrangements for the ordination of Mr. Bell be left in the care of the moderator, the clerk and the minister of City Centre Church and Mr. Bell. **CARRIED**

- The Administrative Committee received a letter from Ruth Chueh and Vancouver Taiwanese Presbyterian Church seeking permission to circulate a request for members of the congregations of presbytery to sign a petition to ask the Government of Canada to issue a commemorative stamp in honour of George Leslie MacKay.

**Recommendation 6:** That the presbytery circulate the letter from VTPC and encourage members of the congregations of our presbytery to sign the petition. **CARRIED**

- The Committee spent time considering the impact of the CoVid-19 epidemic on the congregations and ministries of the presbytery and share a deep concern for the well-being of all ministries within our presbytery, spiritually, financially and otherwise. Given the challenges of this time the Committee recommends the following:

**Recommendation 7:** Given the possibility of financial support for congregations that may be available from various levels of government during this time, and given that navigating these processes may be difficult for some of our congregations and ministries, that members of the presbytery share resources around financial understanding and capacity, especially for treasurers around issues of financial support which may be available to our congregations and ministries from various levels of government. Information to be shared should be forwarded to the Clerk of Presbytery for circulation. This would include people who may act as resources for the broader presbytery. **CARRIED**

**Recommendation 8:** Given that during this time of social distancing, congregations and ministries are not able to meet in person for worship or other meetings, that the presbytery make available grants up to \$2000 per congregation or ministry for the support of initiatives regarding communications and keeping up the relationships which are so crucial to our cohesiveness as congregations and ministries, these grants being subject to approval through the presbytery's Administrative Committee. **CARRIED**

*Respectfully submitted,  
Victor Kim, Clerk*



**The Presbytery of Vancouver Island**

The Presbyterian Church in Canada

Reid Chudley - Moderator

Presbytery of Westminster:

Dear Clerk of Presbytery,

At a duly constituted regular meeting of the Presbytery of Vancouver Island on the 31st day of March, in the year 2020, via Zoom video conference, the Court met and, among other things, considered the Call from Knox Presbyterian Church, Sooke, BC to Stephen P. Bell.

The following motions were made and carried:

That the call from the congregation of Knox Presbyterian Church, Sooke to Stephen P. Bell be sustained as a true gospel call and that it be transmitted to the Presbytery of Westminster for consideration. That R. Lockhart, Director of Denominational Studies at St. Andrew's Hall, be asked to represent the Presbytery of Vancouver Island and the Knox Presbyterian Church, Sooke when the call is considered by the Presbytery of Westminster.

Extracted from the records of the Presbytery of Vancouver Island by J. Paeng, Clerk.  
March 31, 2020.

On behalf of the Presbytery of Vancouver Island, I respectfully request the Presbytery of Westminster to consider sustaining the call to Stephen P. Bell from Knox Presbyterian Church, Sooke, BC.

Please do not hesitate to contact me should you have any further questions.

Blessings,

A handwritten signature in black ink, appearing to read "J. Paeng".

J. Paeng  
Clerk of Presbytery

921 Wembley Rd. Parksville, BC, V9P 2E6  
250-248-2348  
vanislepresbytery@gmail.com

---

921 Wembley Road, Parksville, BC V9P 2E6  
Telephone: 250 248-2348      Email: vanislepresbytery@gmail.com



### Call to a minister of Word and Sacraments and guarantee to presbytery of stipend

(Appendix A-29)

We, the professing members of Knox Presbyterian Church, Sooke, British Columbia, being well satisfied with your faithfulness to the Gospel and your qualifications for the ministry of Word and Sacraments and confident that the Holy Spirit has led us to you, earnestly and solemnly call you, Stephen P. Bell, to become the minister of this Knox Presbyterian Church. In calling you we promise you all due respect, encouragement, and allegiance in the Lord as, together, we seek to use our gifts in the church and in the world to the glory of God.

In order that you, Stephen P. Bell, may be free to devote yourself to ministry of Word and Sacraments among us, we the congregation of Knox Presbyterian Church hereby guarantee to the Presbytery of Vancouver Island, of The Presbyterian Church in Canada, that out of our estimated annual revenue of one hundred thousand and ~~six hundred~~ <sup>fifteen thousand</sup> dollars, we promise and obligate ourselves to provide you, as a first charge thereon, the following annually: <sup>AP</sup>

Annual Stipend		
Option A (inclusive of travel allowance)		\$ 39,554
Option B (exclusive of travel allowance)		\$ _____
with travel reimbursed at \$ ____/km up to annual maximum of		\$ _____
Manse (or Housing/Rental allowance plus utilities)		\$ 31,300
Total	<sup>cell phone</sup> <sup>AP</sup>	\$ 70,754 <sup>AP</sup>

We agree to make payments of the above amounts on the first day of each <sup>month</sup> ~~March~~ [if the minister and the session agree on an alternative payment schedule, amend this statement accordingly,] and agree to adjust the stipend and allowances annually in view of any changes in the cost of living or the needs of our minister.

We agree further:

1. To provide two weeks for continuing education annually and at least the minimum allowance as set by the General Assembly.
2. That the benefits of number 1 above shall be cumulative up to five years.
3. To provide five weeks vacation annually, which shall be used in the year they are given.
4. To pay supply during the periods of continuing education and holidays.
5. In case of disability or extended illness, to continue to provide stipend, accommodation and allowances for a period not less than that set by the General Assembly, and to pay the cost of pulpit supply.
6. To pay for Medical and Dental Insurance as provided through the Pensions and Benefits Board of the General Assembly and to make contributions to the Pension Plan in compliance with the terms of the plan.
7. To pay necessary moving expenses.
8. <sup>AP</sup> <sup>To pay</sup> ~~Optional (such as book allowance, entertainment allowance, internet, cell phone, etc)~~ \$1000 <sup>AP</sup>
9. To provide the opportunity to take an intermission when appropriate

Knox Presbyterian Church Sooke B.C.  
(Place and date) March 25/20  
Sooke B.C. March 25/20  
(Place and date)

David McCall  
(Signature of Presiding Minister)  
A. Sutherland  
(Signature of Meeting Secretary)

Knox Sooke Call to Stephen Bell  
March 25, 2020

The Presbytery of Vancouver Island

Greetings,

I am writing to describe the process and nature of the call which Sooke Presbyterian has voted on and is sending to you asking you to moderate the call of Stephen Bell.

I became interim moderator at Knox Sooke in December 2019 following the departure of the Rev. Chris Clarke for a church in Ontario. I had been doing pulpit supply a month at a time, every other month along with Heather Southam, clerk of session at Knox.

Following my appointment to interim moderator, Chris forwarded to me the profiles of twelve candidates for the position of minister, along with a note that he had been contacted by Rev. Ross Lockhart from St. Andrews Hall recommending that we include a graduating student to our list. This was Stephen Bell, the person the church has chosen.

The committee began its work of reading through all the profiles and I began contacting references. I spoke directly to Ross Lockhart who filled me in on Stephen and highly recommended him as someone with deep experience in church planting, ministry management and working with an inner-city church in East Vancouver. Ross also told me that Stephen was highly respected by all the staff at VST and scored very highly on the psychological profile at the Guidance Conference.

Since Stephen had not yet graduated and had not passed his final interview, he was not eligible to apply for the call, but I was told he was highly motivated to come to Sooke and that with his qualifications, would be in demand across the country if we didn't issue a call.

While he could not contact us, I was free to contact him and spoke briefly over the phone to confirm his interest in Sooke. He said he very much wanted to apply but could not until a date in February.

I informed the search committee of Stephen and his interest as well as the high praise from Ross, so we agreed to give him the opportunity of applying. In the meantime, we went through the list of candidates and created a short list.

In February, Stephen submitted his formal application and after discussions with the search committee and consulting Stephen's references, it was decided we would interview him, which we did in person and unanimously decided to recommend him to the church and invite him to preach at Knox.

In the meantime, the impending pandemic was becoming more imminent by the week, so we moved up the date of his meeting the church to March 22<sup>nd</sup> rather than the agreed date in April, hoping to could stay one step ahead of what became a general quarantine. We were not successful and all church services were cancelled in the Presbytery the week before his date to preach.

We faced a dilemma, not knowing how long this quarantine would last. The church had been informed about Stephen and were eager to meet him, as he was to meet them. We didn't want to postpone indefinitely either for the sake of the church or Stephen.

After discussion by email we decided to invite him to participate in a brief worship and sermon which I recorded and a friend of mine edited and posted to YouTube. The link was given to the congregation who had been informed that this was how we best felt we could proceed. We asked everyone to watch the video and I circulated candid comments about meeting Stephen in person from each member of the search committee.

We established the date of March 24 as the date when we requested people to vote. Since we could not meet publicly to vote, we decided to ask people to vote either by sending a clearly worded email requesting an elder vote for them with instructions on how to vote, or by telephone with the same instructions.

Heather Southam took all the emails and phone calls and then she and I met to go over the list of those who had voted and enter the names into the call document with her witnessing each name and adding her signature. The vote was that out of a total of 25 eligible, we had 23 who voted unanimously in favor of inviting Stephen to become the minister at Knox Sooke. 11 adherents signed the call as well.

Therefore, I have forwarded the completed call documents along with the petition to Presbytery asking that his call be upheld.

At every step we understood that this was a most unusual method, and we proceeded only after consulting both the moderator and clerk of Presbytery about the advisability of this method. I read the Book of Forms thoroughly regarding the call process and two issues seemed to come to the fore:

1. All effort must be taken to ensure that anyone eligible to vote is given ample opportunity and two weeks notice to avail themselves of the occasion to hear and meet the prospective candidate. This we did by email and telephone. No one in the church has said that this did not afford them the opportunity to do what was possible, given the nature of our circumstances.
2. The vote must be taken in such a way and time to ensure that anyone who wishes may freely participate. The fact that 23 out of 25 voted unanimously along with 11

adherents, I believe is evidence that any who wished could easily vote. Heather Southam contacted the two who didn't vote and determined that one chose to abstain and another felt the pressure of the virus quarantine so acutely that voting was pushed off her list of priorities.

And so, given the most unusual nature of our circumstances, I believe we had only one other alternative which would have been to postpone the process indefinitely. That was not the choice we believed to be in everyone's best interest and so we bring this petition to you understanding its unusual nature.

Harold McNabb  
Interim moderator  
Knox Presbyterian Church, Sooke



Dear Moderator and Clerk of Session,

March 9, 2022 is an important date in the history of the Presbyterian Church in Taiwan. It is the 150<sup>th</sup> anniversary of George Leslie Mackay's Arrival in Taiwan. He is the first missionary for the Presbyterian Church in Canada sent to Taiwan. Rev. Dr. George Leslie Mackay (1844-1901) was elected as Moderator of PCC during his second sabbatical June 13, 1894. Due to Rev. Dr. Mackay and his team's hard work, PCC's mission work was very successful. They established 60 congregations, 60 clinics, training more than 60 local pastors, 24 Bible women, and 2633 people were baptized and became Christians. There were many firsts; the first Western college, Oxford College, was founded in northern Taiwan; first Girls' School; first medical hospital. These laid the foundation for mission work, education, and medical service in northern Taiwan. Rev. Dr. Mackay married a Taiwanese woman, Minnie, and they served the Lord together. She expanded the mission work for local women.

In appreciation of the mission work, the Session of Vancouver Taiwanese Presbyterian Church, at its meeting on May 25, 2019, decided to join and support the activities of "150<sup>th</sup> Anniversary of Mackay's Mission Work in Taiwan" including publications of Mackay related research, commemorate stamps, documentary films, and Mackay's spirit in missionary work. We truly believe that it is the responsibility and privilege of Taiwanese immigrant churches to be a bridge between PCC and PCT. In this way, part of history becomes the model for today's mission work and encourages more people to commit to serve Christ.

We would like you to encourage members of your congregation to sign the petition to ask Canada Post to issue a Commemorate George Leslie Mackay Canadian stamp. Canada had influence in Asia 150 years ago. That is the PCC's contribution. This petition is organized by "Canadian Mackay Committee", Warden of Oxford County- Larry Martin is the Co-Chair of the committee. Rev. Michael Stainton of UCC had been a missionary to Taiwan for 10 years is the key person supporting this, he has been studying and doing research about Mackay since his returning to Canada.

We earnestly hope all the activities are to glorify His name.

In Christ,

Ta Li Hsieh  
Moderator

Ruth Chueh  
Clerk of Session

Sign the petition "Canada Post : Commemorate George Leslie Mackay on a Canadian stamp"  
Our goal is to reach 1000 signatures and we need more support. The campaign will go on until December. You can read more and sign the petition here:

<http://chnng.it/cCRF4WY4tj>

## **STRATEGY AND LEADERSHIP COMMITTEE REPORT**

*The report was presented by David Jennings, Strategy and Leadership Committee Convener.  
All motions, unless otherwise noted, were moved by David Jennings, seconded by Pat Dutcher-Walls.*

### **REPORT OF STRATEGY AND LEADERSHIP COMMITTEE April 7, 2020 Presbytery Meeting**

Strategy and Leadership Committee (“SLC”) has divided its duties, with the former Property & Finance committee continuing in its previous tasks and those members not involved in P&F matters focusing on the broader strategic and generative questions for the Presbytery. Since the last Presbytery meeting, SLC members have met three times for the broader strategic issues and twice for property and finance matters, with such meetings including representatives from VCPC and Central as well as VCPC’s project manager Omicron. The following provides highlights of those meetings, decisions made and recommendations advanced to Presbytery.

**A. Vancouver Chinese Presbyterian Church- Presbytery Review of Proposed Project Redevelopment**

P&F has continued its review of Vancouver Chinese Presbyterian Church’s plan to redevelop its sanctuary into a seven-story building that includes a new sanctuary, space for daycare and pre-school facilities, and 20 near-market rental apartments. At the December 2019 Presbytery meeting, P&F presented its analysis of the proposed VCPC redevelopment, noted material questions that remained unanswered and made a recommendation that VCPC hold a congregational meeting with specific requirements set out in the recommendation. After presentations from VCPC representatives raising concerns about P&F’s analysis, the matter was referred back to P&F to review and report back at a subsequent Presbytery meeting. It was noted at that time the delayed decisions could adversely affect the pricing of construction if ultimately the VCPC congregation and Presbytery approved the redevelopment, but the VCPC representatives thought such a delay was acceptable.

Since that Presbytery meeting, P&F sought additional information from the congregation and its development manager Omicron, having had a P&F member work closely with both Omicron and VCPC these past few months and the entire committee having met with both of them. SLC separately considered the strategic issues involved in such a large redevelopment. Having had the questions raised by P&F answered satisfactorily in a recent report from Omicron and VCPC representatives, P&F is now able to provide the following summary of its analysis and to recommend that a congregational meeting be called to consider the proposed redevelopment with all the latest information (some of which was only available in mid-March) and with its results reported at a subsequent Presbytery meeting. It would be at that Presbytery meeting, after considering the results of the congregational vote, a final vote for the redevelopment would be taken by Presbytery. Given the present coronavirus pandemic, the recommendation in this report addresses how that congregational vote could occur in a timely manner.

*Background*

Much of the information below was presented in the materials for the December 2019 Presbytery meeting. However, new information has been provided and included in this report that clarifies some of the questions P&F had raised in December.

*Retainer of Independent Experts*

In January 2019, VCPC and Presbytery established the terms of reference for a development coordinator and the process by which a redevelopment proposal could be advanced, including VCPC putting to tender bids for a project manager and legal counsel. In April 2019 VCPC and the Presbytery jointly engaged the services of Omicron as project manager to analyze VCPC’s proposed development project, testing the assumptions used in VCPC’s redevelopment application and to provide analysis on various matters including the management of project risks. Omicron tabled that report in November. Similarly, in July 2019 VCPC and the Presbytery jointly engaged the services of Miller Thomson LLP as legal counsel to advise on the legal structure and risks associated with such a redevelopment. Miller Thomson has provided an interim and updated memorandum to both parties.

As project manager, Omicron provided tremendously important services as it directed the retainer of a construction manager and other consultants for the pre-construction phase, reviewed and verified (and ultimately undertook the accounting for) the pre-construction expenses, prepared a pro forma budget (that is, a

theoretical future budget based on present expectations) reviewed and then managed the entire budgeting process, including a control budget and options for potential financing of the project.. When the cost of the project exceeded the stipulated parameters, Omicron engaged in the revision of the redevelopment plans and budgeting to bring the costs closer in line with expectations. The feasibility report addressed the regulatory risks (few, given how far the project was advanced), marketing risks (fairly few, given there are only 20 rental units), financing risks (relatively few, given financing is largely from cash and the operating loan will not be significant), and construction development risks (usual risks for a project of this complexity). The biggest risk is, as is usually the case, potential cost overruns.

The legal counsel, being the same law firm that has acted for St. Andrew's Hall, VST and Central Presbyterian Church on their respective property redevelopments, has provided excellent advice and comfort regarding potential legal structures to achieve the proposed VCPC project redevelopment. Like Central's project, legal counsel is recommending that different related structures be set up to address CRA requirements and risk management, some of which would need to occur before any commencement of the redevelopment.

#### *Description of the Proposed Redevelopment*

So what, exactly, is being proposed by VCPC? The existing structure of sanctuary, administrative offices, and daycare will be demolished and a new seven story mixed-use development incorporating (i) a sanctuary and associated office and amenity space on the ground and second floors prepared to a modest finish (no "bells and whistles"); (ii) a nursery school and child daycare located within or adjacent to the sanctuary space on the ground floor and/or second floor prepared to a modest finish; and (iii) 20 housing units on the upper five floors which will be operated as near-market rental apartments. What was not clear in December 2019 was whether the redevelopment could proceed without either the day care or the housing units. It is now clear, based on analysis by Omicron, both the day care and the rental housing units are a requirement of the City of Vancouver for any approval of the redevelopment and any reapplication without both of those aspects of the redevelopment could delay the redevelopment by years. In short, whatever concerns one has about the material construction cost and missional value of the housing units and the day care, they both are required if a redevelopment (as opposed to a renovation) of VCPC's building is to occur in the foreseeable future at the present location.

The cost of the proposed redevelopment project is estimated (within 15%) to be approximately \$31.9 million (including costs incurred to date), which includes a \$2.5 million contingency. The congregation advises that between the proceeds of selling the two ancillary properties for net \$27.3 million and other donations from the congregation, it has almost \$30 million on hand, thus requiring a loan of approximately \$2.0 million to complete the development (any increase or decrease in actual construction costs will amend the loan on a 1:1 basis) if the entire contingency is used and no additional costs are incurred. Based on the above assumptions, the project is expected to provide annual revenue from the apartments on a net operating basis of \$320,000 (a 4% return on cost) and after accounting for the cost of expected continuing debt at 3% annually and the rental of two manse apartments) annual revenue of approximately \$140,000 (a 1.75% return on cost). Based on these estimates and various market assumptions, VCPC could absorb a loan of between \$4 million and \$6 million by using the new rental revenue to cover the interest incurred on loans for above-budgeted construction costs. It is unlikely, especially in light of the present downward economic indicators due to the pandemic and the Canadian economy generally, that there would be cost overruns in excess of both the budgeted contingency and an additional \$4 million. However, in that unlikely event, any increase of the development costs above approximately \$36 million would mean the congregation would have to pay the debt costs from alternative sources (mostly increased donations).

The costs exclude the value of the present land, which BC Assessment has set at \$12.2 million and Omicron estimates to be approximately \$13.0 million. After the redevelopment, the imputed value of the building and

land would be approximately \$33 million. If the imputed cost of the land was included in the project costs, the return on the proposed development would be less than 0.5% (half of one percent). As noted by the consultants, this project would not be approved commercially. But it should be noted most sanctuary buildings are not feasible commercially. The question remains whether the project is appropriate from a missional basis and if it bears too much financial cost and risk for the missional value the building could provide.

#### *P&F Analysis*

The principal work of the proposed redevelopment was initiated and continued within the congregation for several years in consultation with an architect the congregation had retained. In the past year, consultants have been jointly retained by Presbytery (via P&F) and VCPC to provide expertise, experience and independence to analyzing if the redevelopment project is feasible and making proposed changes to meet budgetary goals. Over the past two years P&F has been regularly involved as well as it engaged VCPC on factual, planning and polity issues and reviewed the consultants' work and progress.

P&F, having reviewed the materials provided and the due diligence performed with legal counsel and the project manager, is comfortable assuring Presbytery that excellent work by the consultants has been done and rigour applied to maximize the benefits and manage the risks of such a large redevelopment. If the proposed redevelopment project is approved by Presbytery, P&F expects the project to be executed well using the parties now under contract and that neither VCPC nor Presbytery would face material risks not associated usually with any construction project. The one caveat: construction costs in Vancouver are notoriously difficult to establish and firm contracts have not yet been obtained (which is appropriate given approval from Presbytery has not been obtained). However, with a budget estimate allowing for a 15% variance and with a budgeted contingency of about 8.5% and the revenue from apartment rentals able to carry an additional 13.6% cost increase, the congregation is unlikely to find itself with interest costs that could not be covered by the project's revenues. A fixed price construction project could be obtained, but that would increase the fees from the construction manager and that option has not yet been considered by VCPC.

There is one planning issue that should be highlighted. There had been some discussion by VCPC representatives that the 20 housing rental units could be sold to a third party for an upfront cash payment, although those representatives stated they had no intention to make such a sale in the near future. This idea has been more widely discussed now that consultants have confirmed VCPC will be required to carry debt if the proposed redevelopment occurs. P&F would strongly recommend that VCPC not be allowed to conduct such a potential sale, because if title to those rental units were surrendered to a third party, VCPC and Presbytery would lose control over any future redevelopment or reimagining of the VCPC property's use. Title would be held by others and contracts and charges to VCPC's title would require present use to continue in its present configuration and any default could result in losing the entire building to the third-party rental unit owners. P&F would not recommend the proposed redevelopment project if it included the possibility of present or future sale of the rental units to a third party.

It would be naïve to ignore the present turbulence within the denomination regarding Remits B and C from the 2019 General Assembly and how it might affect the congregation immediately prior to one of the most expensive redevelopments in the denomination's history. In 2016 the congregation, along with 35 other congregations across the country submitted an overture to General Assembly seeking "gracious dismissal" that would allow congregations to leave the denomination with their property if the definition of marriage was changed. Any decision by General Assembly is now postponed until 2021 with the cancellation of the 2020 General Assembly. The general concern would arise if a material number of VCPC members and or elders left the congregation if the Remits passed (or if tired waiting for the resolution of the matter) while the construction project was underway and left the redevelopment project without leadership or continuing congregational financial support. VCPC



representatives recognized the concern but noted that even in the shadow of the present uncertainty surrounding who might control congregational property, many congregants continued to donate money for the redevelopment and supported the redevelopment. VCPC representatives committed to follow the leading of the Holy Spirit as expressed within the denomination's polity and expressed their commitment to advancing this project within the PCC.

#### *The Role of SLC*

Through VCPC's application process for redevelopment, some members of Presbytery and VCPC have questioned the role of Presbytery in the approval process, and even why such approval is required. Under our denomination's rules, a congregation "owns" its land, buildings and assets subject to trust obligations owed to the congregation, Presbytery and the national denomination, so that a congregation is given restricted stewardship as long as the congregation exists. That stewardship role requires, among other actions, seeking the approval of Presbytery if any extraordinary actions or changes are to occur within a congregation, whether it be the calling of a minister or a redevelopment or sale of a property. Presbytery's approval is not merely to "rubberstamp" whatever a congregation wants, but requires Presbytery to discern if the land, buildings and assets are being used well for Kingdom purposes. Presbytery, like all courts of the church, has at times failed to exercise its duties effectively. There have been recent examples where building projects were approved by Presbytery that ultimately did not have the support of all the leadership or most of the congregation, and strife ensued that damaged the congregation and its witness to its community. In the present situation, VCPC, like many of our congregations, is facing difficult issues such as involving the potential adoption of Remits B and C from the 2019 General Assembly, future leadership changes, dwindling numbers of members, and potential property taxes and other financial stresses, among other challenges. Our past failings should not be an excuse for Presbytery to forego due oversight but rather should cause us to perform that duty well to ensure that the redevelopment is a wise and faithful act of stewardship by the congregation, which includes ensuring Presbytery knows the congregation and its leadership are fully supportive of the project.

In light of the information above, SLC believes it is reasonable to require that it obtain evidence that the congregation has, with all the updated information now available, performed a serious analysis of the missional goals of the redevelopment and considered other missional alternatives. Those goals were presented in written form through the March 2020 Omicron report. That report, summarizing representations made to the consultant by VCPC representatives, highlighted that the congregation's present activities exceed the limited space of the present building and require renting space in neighbouring buildings, and the lack of congregational space is believed by VCPC to limit future potential missional work. SLC has expressed interest in having missional alternatives placed before the congregation as it considers whether to vote in favour of the proposed redevelopment.

*Alternatives that SLC believes the congregation should be aware of in light of the present and updated information:*

1. Spend approximately \$6-10 million to renovate the present building to the studs: invest the remaining funds and generate about \$1.0 million annually for use for missional purposes of the congregation. This would not increase the size of the building envelope but it may be made more efficient and updated and eliminate the mold problems.
2. Sell the present sanctuary property to move to a missionally strategic location, just as the congregation had done previously in the early 1980s. The BC Assessment value of the sanctuary property is \$12.2 million, and Omicron estimates to be approximately \$13.0 million. With those funds, together with the present \$28 million the congregation could consider multiple opportunities for missionally focused

ministries, including amalgamating with another PCC congregation, purchasing a church sanctuary in a strategically important place in the city that is for sale, the rental of facilities, a joint ministry with other organizations, or other alternatives determined by the congregation.

3. Redevelop the property as set out in the Omicron report.

This is a significant proposal by the congregation, being one of the largest property redevelopments in our denomination's history. Given (i) a decision of this magnitude, (ii) the length of time the project has taken from initial congregational input until today and the numerous changes in Cambie real estate, construction costs, and the congregation itself in that time, and (iii) the great constraints required by the City of Vancouver and the financing realities of such a large project, it is appropriate to present to the congregation (as is required by the Book of Forms) a fulsome description of the proposed redevelopment and the alternatives set out above, with a simple question if the congregation supports the project as described or rather one of the alternatives. SLC recognizes that the present pandemic makes such a meeting impossible for now. SLC would emphasize that for Presbytery to perform its duty well, the meeting should be in person. SLC encourages VCPC to wait until the congregation can physically meet once again. If no such physical meeting occurs because VCPC desires to bring the redevelopment project to a conclusion, then SLC believes Presbytery will want greater proof of the congregation's understanding of the proposed redevelopment and the above-mentioned alternatives as well as a high level of support given no debate or discussion will effectively occur with the latest facts and analysis. SLC has consulted with the Clerks of Assembly about acceptable alternatives to a physical meeting and believes a "mail in vote" would be the best alternative to an actual physical congregational meeting (which remains SLC's preferred method). As such, the recommendation below sets out both how a physical or a mail in vote could occur.

Once a congregational vote is taken on the terms set out in the following recommendation and the results of that congregational vote are known, SLC will come to a subsequent Presbytery meeting with a positive or negative recommendation on the VCPC redevelopment proposal itself. SLC recognizes that any positive recommendation would include VCPC addressing:

- Certain legal title issues requiring transfers to new related entities that would need to be addressed before construction commences (SLC would seek power to issue on this point based on legal advice received).
- Registered notice on title that there could be no transfer of ownership of the rental apartments in the future.
- Binding contracts with an external project manager (Omicron) and construction manager (Bird construction) within the parameters described in this memorandum, which includes a cost estimate that could vary up to 15%.

Prior to addressing the recommendations John Con, Rep Elder for VCPC, addressed the court.

**Recommendation No. 1**

BE IT RESOLVED THAT Presbytery will consider the redevelopment of the buildings and land of Vancouver Chinese Presbyterian Church at a meeting of Presbytery subsequent to when the congregation satisfies either Process A or Process B, as chosen by the Session of Vancouver Chinese Presbyterian Church (recognizing the concerns expressed by SLC in its report about Process B):

**Process A**

- (i) the Session of Vancouver Chinese Presbyterian Church duly calls and constitutes an in-person meeting of the congregation of Vancouver Chinese Presbyterian Church (once permitted by governmental health authorities) at which there is a minimum of two-thirds of those present and voting in favour of such redevelopment proposal (as per Section 162.1 of the Book of Forms)
- (ii) the notice for such a congregational meeting will (i) specify the details of the congregational vote about the proposed redevelopment and missional alternatives, and (ii) include written materials related to the redevelopment proposal and an analysis of other options, all such materials in both English and Cantonese at least 15 days before the meeting date (after review and approval by Strategy and Leadership Committee);
- (iii) members of Strategy and Leadership Committee will be invited to attend and speak at the congregational meeting for the purpose of addressing questions or concerns from the congregation about any redevelopment proposal, other potential options, and the process leading up to the meeting.

**Process B**

- (i) a written notice is delivered to all VCPC members and adherents who contribute regularly for the support of the church and its ordinances. That notice will (i) specify the details of the congregational vote about the proposed redevelopment and missional alternatives (ii) include written materials related to the redevelopment proposal and an analysis of other options; and (iii) contain a voting ballot and a double envelope, all such materials in both English and Cantonese at least 21 days before the deadline for the balloted votes to be returned (after review and approval by Strategy and Leadership Committee);
- (ii) a videoconference be organized after the notice and materials are sent to allow for questions and comments by the congregation about the proposed redevelopment and missional alternatives, at which members of SLC will be invited to attend and speak, as well as the provision of an email address where congregants and adherents may write on a confidential basis to Presbytery about their views of the proposed redevelopment;
- (iii) The balloted votes will be counted by the Clerk of Session and Clerk of Presbytery, with the results reported to both VCPC and the Presbytery when known.

**CARRIED**

**B. Central Presbyterian Church-Title Transfer and Related Matters**

P&F had requested an independently-prepared future-oriented cash flow analysis to determine the anticipated revenues and expenses of the congregation and each of its proposed divisions, being (i) property for congregational use in the name of the Church trustees, (ii) low-income housing in a housing society, and (iii) a street level space of 2,275 sq. ft. available for a store offering retail goods or services, an artist studio, a fitness centre, a child day care facility, or any congregational activities in a charitable foundation. In February that cash flow analysis was presented by Morrison Hershfield, an engineering and consulting services firm. A detailed review of the analysis was undertaken (including with the author of the report) and the findings discussed by both P&F and SLC generally. SLC contacted Central with a summary of SLC's findings and requested input from Central.

The findings, based on the Morrison Hershfield analysis, suggest that there is a material structural long-term deficit in the combined financial activities of the congregation, the housing society, and foundation. While more

analysis will be done once further information is provided by Central, it is important to provide this information to Presbytery now as it considers SLC's recommendations below.

The Morrison Hershfield report extrapolates present revenue numbers for the congregation, the housing society, and anticipated revenue for the retail space over a 40-year period. It may be reasonable to assume some deterioration of rental income either due to regulations limiting rent increases or just the aging of the housing units, but that was beyond the scope of the report. Further, the report was prepared on a Class D basis, which means costs could swing +/- 50%. Given construction in Vancouver, such cost estimates are routinely seen years later as underrepresenting the costs actually incurred. For the purposes of the following conclusions, only capital costs were adjusted beyond the estimated median numbers presented.

If the total annual cost of a minister of \$120,000 (stipend, housing allowance, pension, etc., which was the amount estimated by Central) is included in the annual expenses of Central (but no Presbytery dues, no Presbyterian Sharing, and no ministry program costs are included), the combined revenues of the congregation, the housing society and foundation will generate a deficit of \$1.1 million over 40 years. If an additional ministry costs are incurred (it seems from its annual reports to the denomination Central has spent about \$70,000 a year on these additional items), then the deficit is closer to \$4 million over 40 years. If capital costs of the building were 30% higher than present costing (in real terms) 25-40 years from now, the congregation would incur an additional \$7.2 million deficit in excess of the \$4 million deficit. A 50% increase in capital costs in real terms (which is within the variability of the estimate provided by Morrison Hershfield in the report) would result in a total deficit of over \$16 million in the 40-year period. Again, it bears repeating that no erosion of housing or commercial lease rental income over the four decades is incorporated into these estimates despite the aging of the building.

A summary of this information is set out in the table on the next page (all negative or deficit numbers are in parenthesis):

<b>Property Use</b>	<b>Congregation Space</b>	<b>Housing Society</b>	<b>Street Level Space</b>	<b>Combined Net Deficit</b>
Net Income (Expense) with minister over 40 years	(\$15.2 million)	\$7.2 million	\$6.9 million	(\$1.1 million)
Net Income (Expense) with minister and average program budget over 40 years	(\$18.1 million)	\$7.2 million	\$6.9 million	(\$4.0 million)
With capital cost increases -30%	(\$20.7 million)	\$2.8 million	\$6.65 million	(\$11.2 million)
With capital cost increases -50%	(\$22.4 million)	(\$0.1million)	\$6.5 million	(\$16.0 million)

Under the contracts with Bosa Development, all of the properties could be lost to Bosa Development if Central cannot pay its proportionate share of all capital contributions as and when due. Given the apparent material structural deficit in the finances and the legal risk of losing the entire property if costs are not covered, P&F has been attempting to understand how to limit the financial and legal risks if the property is divided into the three divisions as set out above. SLC, concerned with the strategic vision and mission of the congregation and its impact on Presbytery given the Morrison Hershfield analysis, is hoping to work with the congregation on strategic planning as it enters this liminal time as its minister retires. It is fortunate that much of these cash flow issues

arise several years from now once building upkeep becomes more expensive. Until then, cash flow in the congregation should be sufficient to give the congregation time to develop and implement a strategic plan to address the material long term financial deficit. With the Presbyter of Mission and Vision available as a key resource, SLC is confident that with proper lay leadership in the congregation, a vibrant, thriving congregation can exist now only now but in the coming decades. But SLC wishes to emphasize that the congregation must start its strategic planning now, as part of its self-study before seeking any new minister, if it is to obtain the leadership it requires and reduce the present risks to Central and to Presbytery.

#### *SLC Meeting with Central Session*

Both SLC and Central's Session had expressed the desire to meet one another, which was arranged by way of a Zoom videoconference on March 23. At that meeting were several elders of Central, five SLC members, and Rev. Paddy Eastwood as convener of the Ministry Committee. SLC and Central's Session discussed several topics which had been or were at present an impediment to a better working relationship between Central and Presbytery. Some Central elders expressed frustration at what they perceived to be a lack of interest in and support of Central over the years. It was evident that Central's Session was unaware of some past activities, some present facts, the role of P&F, and the financial and legal risks and ramifications pertaining to the new redevelopment and legal title, some of which is set out above in this report. Central's Session agreed that it needed to commence strategic planning now that the new sanctuary has been established and Rev. Jim Smith is retiring. Rev. Paddy Eastwood outlined the process for Presbytery's engagement with the congregation during the upcoming vacancy. It is SLC's hope that Central's Session will be able to demonstrate an understanding of what is required to manage present and future risks of the congregation and will provide the necessary information to P&F so it can complete its task of understanding, identifying and reducing financial and legal risks to Central and Presbytery.

#### *A Potential Commercial Lease*

All of the above information is important when considering that Central contacted P&F in February to seek Presbytery approval for entering into a 10 year lease for a bulk pet food company in its street level space. On a positive note, the rent appears to be close to full market rates for the space (although it is not clear given the pandemic that such an offer to rent still exists). The congregation, given the structural deficit assumes such rental income, will only be worse off financially if no commercial lease is executed. However, SLC and P&F both recognize that the congregation should be hesitant to enter a 10 year commitment with a retail store prior to the Session engaging in any strategic planning at a time when congregational leadership is changing and the new PMV is coming to the Presbytery. SLC has concluded that this is the only ministry space visible to the general public from street level and it would be prudent to postpone any long-term lease until a study has determined the highest and best use for that space missionally. This might be a commercial lease to fund other missional work or specific congregational work that could introduce the community directly to Central and its ministries.

#### **Recommendation No. 2**

BE IT RESOLVED THAT Presbytery withhold its approval for any lease of more than three years of the street level space at Central Presbyterian Church unless and until a fulsome strategic plan, reviewed and endorsed by the Presbyter of Mission and Vision, has concluded that the highest and best use for that space missionally is a commercial lease to fund other missional work of Central.

**Amendment moved by Laurie Deacon, seconded by Neil Abramson**, that the word “three” be replaced with “five” and after the words Central Presbyterian Church insert the following “*with a potential subsequent 5-year option exercisable by the tenant subject to receiving subsequent approval of presbytery.*” **Amendment CARRIED**

**Motion as amended CARRIED.**

David Jennings spoke to a late piece of correspondence from the Presbyterian Senior Citizens’ Housing Society encouraging congregations who wish to explore a partnership with PSCHS to do so around possible low-cost housing for seniors.

*Respectfully Submitted,  
David Jennings, Convener*

## **MINISTRY COMMITTEE REPORT**

*The report was presented Paddy Eastwood, Ministry Committee Convener.*

*All motions, unless otherwise noted, were moved by Paddy Eastwood, seconded by Bev Shepansky.*

### **Ministry Committee Report to the Presbytery April 7, 2020**

The Ministry Committee met by zoom on March 17, 2020.

The Committee is considering how best to structure itself in order to do the work assigned to it. It is likely that the committee will form task forces with areas of responsibility, but this is still a work in progress.

#### **Interim Moderator for Central PC**

The Rev Jim Smith is retiring as of Easter Sunday, April 12, 2020. In consultation with the session of Central Presbyterian Church, the Ministry Committee has appointed the Rev. Cal Macleod to serve as Interim Moderator. With the arrival of Dale Woods, Presbytery for Mission and Vision in August, the Interim Moderator will initially help the session work with the Strategy and Leadership Committee and arrange for pulpit supply but not move toward a call until Dale Woods has had a chance to give his input.

#### **First New Westminster**

It has been brought to the attention of the Ministry Committee that there is some doubt that First Presbyterian Church, New Westminster can continue to afford to pay for half-time Stated Supply ministry. In addition, there are tensions between the minister and the session. Therefore the Ministry Committee recommends

**Recommendation 1:** that the contract between the Rev Guy Sinclair and First Presbyterian Church be renewed on a monthly basis. **CARRIED**

**Recommendation 2:** that a visitation committee consisting of Richard Watson (convener), Gordon Shields, Larry Yen, Ian Rokeby and Emily Wilson be sent to meet with the session (including its finance and maintenance and treasurer) of First Presbyterian Church, New Westminster to examine their financial situation, the relationship between the minister and the elders and the health of the congregation in order to ascertain their ability to continue with a half-time Stated Supply ministry and report back to Presbytery by the May meeting. **CARRIED**

**Recommendation 3:** that the session of First Presbyterian Church, New Westminster give to the visitation committee the congregational budgets 2017-2020 and any other resources as requested by the visitation committee. **CARRIED**

#### **Call to Mr. Stephen Bell**

The Ministry Committee has examined the call documents for the call from Knox Presbyterian, Sooke, BC to Mr. Stephen Bell and finds them in good order. We are delighted for Mr. Bell and support this call.

#### **Student Certification**

The committee met with the following students on Tuesday, March 3, 2020 at Central Presbyterian Church: Sam Andri, Shirley Carleton, Daniel Martinez, Chanil Lee, Nathaniel Hartley, and Karen Tin.

During the interviews we asked the students, how they were progressing in their studies, and if there was anything that we as a committee could do to support them while they were studying.

Two of the students were being received for the first time: Sam Andri and Karen Tin while the others: Shirley Carleton, Daniel Martinez, Chanil Lee, and Nathaniel Hartley were being interviewed for re-certification.

**Recommendations 4-9 were moved as a block.**

#### **Sam Andri**

Sam arrived in Canada from Indonesia three years ago.

In his younger years (up to 6 or 7) Sam attended a Presbyterian church but life changed and his family began to attend a Pentecostal church. Around the age of 21 Sam began to ask questions about his faith. He experienced, what he called, a few negative feelings, that he had to work through.

It was after working through these feelings that he felt that something was missing in his life and he began to study theology at the Theological Centre for Asia (TCA College-Pentecostal/Assemblies of God) in Singapore. He graduated in 2011. In 2014 Sam began part time studies for his Master of Theology at Bandung Theological Seminary (Reformed), Indonesia. Sam indicated that while at seminary, he learned about Sally McFee and from this knowledge he decided that VST was a good place to continue his theological studies in North America. In 2016, Sam came to Canada to continue his studies at VST.

Sam is worshipping at Richmond Presbyterian Church. When he first began worshipping there, he struggled with the music because he felt that it did not allow the worshippers feelings to be expressed, as he had experienced in his Pentecostal upbringing. But the Presbyterian church has a depth of theology that was missing in his Pentecostal roots. He experienced the depth of this theology when he was baptized last year, this experience he described as being beautiful.

Sam is married and his wife, Christa, is working in a bakery in Richmond.

**Recommendation 4:** That the Presbytery of Westminster grant initial certification to Sam Andri and that he be placed under our care as he continues his studies at the Vancouver School of Theology. **CARRIED**

**Shirley Carleton**

Shirley continues her studies at VST. She is taking the second part of Hebrew bible, a course on evangelism and spiritual care. Shirley has learned to set boundaries on her time and learned to say no; because she is also working part time at Delta View and participating in the worship life of her home congregation. With her busy schedule, structure has been a necessity that she has added to her life.

Shirley's husband is very supported of her education and at times Shirley says it seems like his behaviour is like that of a parent; making sure that Shirley maintains a balance in her life.

**Recommendation 5:** That the Presbytery of Westminster grant recertification to Shirley Carleton to continue her studies in preparation for Ordination to the Ministry of Word and Sacrament in the Presbyterian Church in Canada. **CARRIED**

**Daniel Martinez**

Daniel has had a very busy fall at St Andrews St Stephens: planning for a trip for 18 youth to visit Ensenada and the training of volunteers to accompany those youth, his regular studies, and family living. The youth trip to Ensenada he described as being a spiritual and Christian discipleship experience for the youth.

Daniel shared with us that his graduation will be about 2 years from now.

**Recommendation 6:** That the Presbytery of Westminster grant recertification to Daniel Martinez to continue his studies in preparation for Ordination to the Ministry of Word and Sacrament in the Presbyterian Church in Canada. **CARRIED**

**Chanil Lee**

Chanil continues to work on his Th.M. degree. He is presently working with the youth of the Vancouver Taiwanese Presbyterian Church. He views this experience as similar to what Jonah Lin experienced – working with the youth was not his plan, it was God's plan. The youth ask tough questions that are difficult to answer, but it is through God's power and wisdom that he has been able to work through this experience.

Chanil did tell us that part of the difficulty was that his English is not as good as he feels it should be and seeks out as many experiences that he can to practice speaking English.

**Recommendation 7:** That the Presbytery of Westminster grant recertification to Chanil Lee to continue his studies in preparation for Ordination to the Ministry of Word and Sacrament in the Presbyterian Church in Canada. **CARRIED**

**Nathaniel Hartley**

Nat is studying at Regent College and shared with us that he has completed 13 of his 15 courses there. He is working with the youth group at Fairview PC and spends 1 hour each week with the minister. He has discovered, that working with the youth is not easy because even though they have been raised in the church, they do not feel that Sunday morning worship is something that is necessary for them.

Nat told us that he expects to complete his M.Div. degree in 2022.



**Recommendation 8:** That the Presbytery of Westminster grant recertification to Nathaniel Hartley to continue his studies in preparation for Ordination to the Ministry of Word and Sacrament in the Presbyterian Church in Canada. **CARRIED**

### **Karen Tin**

Karen is from Indonesia and is a friend of Sam Andri. Her family worshipped in a Roman Catholic church. She feels her personal faith journey began at 10 years of age, but it was not until she began to worship at a Pentecostal church that she experienced God. She was involved with the teen and youth ministry at her Pentecostal church.

Karen began her studies in psychology at Universitas Pelita Harapan Indonesia. She shared with us that the Universitas Pelita Harapan was conservative in its theology because of its Dutch Reformed influence. Karen has shared her official transcript with us and it appears that the bulk of her marks were A's and B's. After graduation with her BA in psychology, she taught for three years at the IPEKA Integrated Christian School.

In 2018, Karen came to Canada to study at VST. She will be finishing her Master of Arts in Public and Pastoral Leadership in May. Her plan is to begin her M.Div. studies in the fall of 2020. She shared with us that many of the courses she has taken for her M.A.P.P.L. cannot be transferred to an M.Div. degree and that she still has another 2 or 3 years of study.

Karen speaks English, Indonesian and Mandarin. She is working at the Japanese bakery in Metrotown.

**Recommendation 9:** That the Presbytery of Westminster grant initial certification to Karen Tin and that she be placed under our care as she continues her studies at the Vancouver School of Theology. **CARRIED**

## **COMMUNITY ENGAGEMENT COMMITTEE REPORT**

*The report was presented by Sumarme Goble, Community Engagement Committee Member.  
All motions, unless otherwise noted, moved by Sumarme Goble, seconded by Neil Abramson.*

### **Community Engagement April Report to Presbytery**

Although Community Engagement Committee (CEC) did not meet in March, the grant application to the Regional Resource Fund from the Urban Camp Ministry in New Westminster and Burnaby was circulated by email and members of the committee responded in favour of this recommendation:

**Recommendation #1:** that Presbytery approve the request from the Urban Camp Ministry in New Westminster and Burnaby for a grant of \$3,000 for 2020. **CARRIED**

*Respectfully submitted,  
Isabel Evans.*



### Christian Urban Camps 2020 Application for \$3000 from the Regional Resourcing Grant

The funding will be used to support the staffing of our expanded Christian Urban Camps being offered for our fourth year by the Collaborating Churches of New West and Burnaby.

The Collaborating Churches in New West and Burnaby came together in 2016 to develop ways in which the four small Presbyterian congregations (Knox New West, St. Aidan's New West, Gordon Burnaby, and Brentwood Burnaby) could support each other in mission in their respective, rapidly growing, and very different urban neighbourhoods. First Presbyterian Church, New Westminster, has joined the collaboration this year, so there are now five churches involved in this initiative.

As we become more and more aware of the implications of our confession to Indigenous peoples in 1994 of the ways we have misrepresented Jesus, we think this element in choosing and customizing our programming is important. In 2017, we developed a curriculum focused on being good neighbours in our urban contexts, using Jesus' parable of the Good Samaritan. In 2018, we focused on being resilient in the face of bullying, using the story of Joseph. Last year and this coming year, we have reviewed and adapted curricula developed by the MennoMedia. It enables us to work with the children to imagine ways of being a positive influence for reconciliation in our communities.

A good sense of what happened at last year's camps can be found on our Facebook page - <https://www.facebook.com/christianurbancamp/>. You might also want to explore our website at <https://www.christianurbancamp.ca/>. In 2019, we had over 60 kids in the camps, a significant increase from 2018. We also hosted for two day 60 children from China. We are confident that we can work with even more children in 2020, with four sites in operation (Knox, St. Aidan's, Gordon, and First – Brentwood does not have space). Several of the children who attended last year have already said they want to return and bring friends. We will keep the fees for the week low - \$100/child for a full day – so it is affordable to more people. Interestingly, some of the children come to all four weeks of the camps, making the impact of their participation even stronger. We have created special reduced rates for those attending for more than one week.

We added a joint worship service among the Collaborating Churches, with a picnic, on the last Sunday of July to include a children's choir singing the songs they learned at the camps. 140 people from all five congregation attended and contributed almost \$500 for the 2020 camps.

This coming year will again provide the children with t-shirts featuring the camp logo and text. They will be a great reminder to the kids of what they have learned, make the camps better known in their neighbourhoods throughout the year, and help us keep track of them during our outdoor activities. Our logo again this year is from a painting by Christian artist He Qi and is used with permission.

There are several innovative missional initiatives designed into this project:

- The outreach to and support of a broad population of children in the neighbourhoods of the collaborating churches hosting the camps (these neighbourhoods are rapidly expanding, with projected population growth over the next 20 years being over 100,000 people);
- The trust and goodwill being built among five small congregations who are becoming much stronger in their neighbourhoods and much more creative in our joint programing as a result of the collaboration;

The Presbytery of Westminster  
Regular Meeting via Zoom Video Conferencing  
April 7, 2020

8984

- The connections with a wide variety of community support programs for children and families in the two municipalities where we publicize the camps; and
- The learning opportunities for the staff and volunteers at the camps.

The contact person for this grant application is Brian Fraser at [jazzthinkbrian@gmail.com](mailto:jazzthinkbrian@gmail.com) or 604-924-9650. Brentwood Presbyterian Church is at 1600 Delta Ave, Burnaby, BC, V5B 3G2. Our registration # with CRA is 106808363 RR0001.

We are deeply grateful for the support from Regional Resourcing Grant over the initial years of this project, as we got it off the ground. We have experienced significant growth, not only in the size and impact of the camps, but also in the imagining of ways these five congregations can support each other in their missions. Your ongoing prayers and financial support are deeply appreciated and most encouraging.

**Proposed Budget for 2020**

**Income**

Opening Balance (2019)	\$ 5,940.11
Church Donations (5 x \$500)	\$ 2,500.00
Fees	\$ 4,000.00
Regional Grant	\$ 3,000.00
Hermes Lodge	\$ 3,000.00
<b>TOTAL</b>	<b>\$18,440.11</b>

**Expenses**

Administrator Marion	\$ 2,000.00
Director Rebecca (3 weeks)	\$ 3,200.00 (At CY on week)
Assistant Director Mae (2 weeks)	\$ 1,600.00
Assistant Director Bill (4 weeks)	\$ 3,200.00
Music	\$ 2,000.00
T Shirts	\$ 1,000.00
Advertising	\$ 300.00
Bus	\$ 1,000.00
Material	\$ 1,000.00
Bursaries	\$ 1,000.00
Volunteer Coordinator	\$ 500.00
Outdoor Activities	\$ 500.00
Contingency	\$ 1,140.11
<b>TOTAL</b>	<b>\$18,440.11</b>

## HUMMINGBIRD MINISTRIES COMMITTEE REPORT

### Hummingbird Ministries Report, April 2020.

Providing opportunities for healing and reconciliation  
Through Circles and the Arts  
To restore hope, freedom and justice in Indigenous/Settler relationships  
socially, politically and spiritually.

Hummingbird Council (HC) met by Zoom March 27, 2020. It was decided that the above statement of purpose/mission would appear on all of our future correspondence.

Our meetings are always opened with prayer and passing the feather in a sharing circle. This helps to set the tone of our meetings.

We reviewed the Director's report that included Mary's work and all of the grants that would be applied for in 2020. It was agreed to postpone all events until after the pandemic has passed. Peace through the Arts Festival has been postponed till November and we will be partnering with the Peninsula United Church in White Rock for this event. The PCC Indigenous Wisdom Conference will be delayed until Spring or Fall 2021.

It was agreed that we should look into seeking suggestions for resource people or Indigenous children's books on dealing with bullying. There was a suggestion that we should spend a little more for gifts for the children at our Christmas Circle. A benefit concert for financial support of this, will be explored at Brentwood Presbyterian Church.

It was decided that Mary and Laurie would work on creating a job description for an admin assistant for Mary. Hopefully with an assistant Mary will be freed up to do more pastoral and children's work,

The financial reports indicate that we are in a positive situation at present.

As it had been raised at the Administrative Committee that HM was a society this was discussed, and it was agreed that HM was not formed as a society. HM is a specialised ministry of the Presbytery of Westminster.

**Moved by Brian Fraser, seconded by Pat Dutcher-Walls,** that the treasurer for Hummingbird Ministries be allowed to submit an application to the Synod of BC's Jack Smith Fund in the amount of \$8,000 in April 2020 for their 2021 budget year. **CARRIED**

*Respectfully Submitted,  
Isabel Evans*

## ANNOUNCEMENTS

The Moderator led the court in prayer.

## ADJOURNMENT

Moved by Brian Fraser, seconded by Bev Shepansky to adjourn the meeting.

**CARRIED**

- The next regular meeting of presbytery is **May 5, 2020 at Kerrisdale & Vancouver Taiwanese Presbyterian Churches**, 2733 West 41st Avenue, Vancouver.
- It is highly likely that the restrictions on in person meetings will still be in effect at that time so the presbytery will likely meet again via Zoom.
- Worship is to be led by the leadership of Camp Douglas.

The Moderator closed the court with a benediction.